

To the Dissertation Council for the Educational Program "8D01103 – Pedagogy and Psychology" at the Buketov Karaganda National Research University
REVIEW OF THE FOREIGN SUPERVISOR
on the dissertation submitted by Nazerke Amanzhol

Topic: « Developing professionally oriented foreign language communicative competence of science pre-service teachers based on CLIL»

Submitted for the degree of: Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) Educational Program: 8D01103 – Pedagogy and Psychology

In the contemporary landscape of global higher education, the integration of Content and Language Integrated Learning (CLIL) and the shift towards English Medium Instruction (EMI) represent significant paradigm shifts. Educational systems ranging from Europe to East Asia face an identical challenge: a critical shortage of qualified Science teachers who possess not merely general language proficiency, but the specific pedagogical capacity to use a foreign language as a cognitive tool for instruction.

The dissertation research by Nazerke Amanzhol addresses this pressing global issue by utilizing the context of Kazakhstan's trilingual education policy as a unique "living laboratory." The relevance of this work to the international academic community lies in its shift of focus from General English training to the formation of specialized Professional Communicative Competence. The doctoral candidate treats language not as an object of study, but as a professional instrument for scaffolding learning, which aligns perfectly with modern international standards in Teacher Education.

As a foreign supervisor, I would like to specifically highlight the candidate's high methodological culture and the alignment of the research design with international standards of evidence-based pedagogy.

The dissertation employs a robust Mixed Methods Research Design, allowing for a comprehensive and objective analysis of the phenomenon. The use of a quasi-experimental design with control and experimental groups ensured the reliability of the data. I specifically commend the application of modern statistical tools: data processing was conducted using Jamovi software (aligning with Open Science standards), and hypothesis testing was correctly performed using Student's t-test. The validation of diagnostic instruments, such as the Self-Efficacy Scale, was conducted competently with necessary psychometric calculations.

The inclusion of semi-structured interviews and pedagogical observation allowed for data triangulation. This enabled the author to capture not only statistical knowledge gains but also deep shifts in the professional identity, motivation, and anxiety levels of pre-service teachers in an EMI context.

The theoretical framework of the research is grounded in a deep critical analysis of both classical and contemporary literature. The doctoral candidate demonstrated excellent command of the material, effectively utilizing David Coyle's "4Cs" framework (Content, Communication, Cognition, Culture) and Jim Cummins' theories on BICS/CALP.

The scientific novelty, significant for the international context, lies in the author's conceptualization of "Integrated Subject-Language Competence" specifically for science teachers. Nazerke Amanzhol convincingly argues that this competence includes specific skills, such as instructional scaffolding and the management of students' cognitive load in a second language. The developed Structural-Content Model represents a holistic system integrating motivational, cognitive, and operational components, serving as a potential blueprint for CLIL teacher training programs globally.

The research results have undergone rigorous validation at the international level. The publication of 4 articles in high-impact peer-reviewed journals indexed in Scopus and Web of Science (Q1 and Q2 quartiles) testifies to the exceptional productivity of the doctoral candidate.

Articles in prestigious journals such as the Asia Pacific Education Review and Asian Education and Development Studies confirm that the research has withstood strict blind peer review and contributes meaningfully to the global scientific discourse on multilingual education.

Throughout our collaboration, Nazerke Amanzhol has proven herself to be a thoughtful, independent, and highly motivated researcher. She possesses developed critical thinking skills, the ability to work with primary English-language sources, and the capacity to constructively accept scientific criticism. The candidate demonstrated the ability to integrate local educational objectives with global best practices, while strictly adhering to principles of academic integrity and research ethics.

The dissertation by Nazerke Amanzhol is a completed, original, and methodologically sound piece of scholarly work. It makes a substantial contribution to the development of the theory and methodology of professional education, offering effective solutions to the problem of teacher training for multilingual environments.

I believe that the dissertation fully meets the quality criteria required for doctoral research, and Nazerke Amanzhol is unreservedly deserving of the award of the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) in the Educational Program 8D01103 – "Pedagogy and Psychology".

Foreign Scientific Supervisor:

Ján Danek,

Prof., PaedDr., PhD.

**Department of Pedagogy Faculty of Education,
Comenius University in Bratislava, the Slovak Republic**

Date: January 29, 2026

UNIVERZITA KOMENSKÉHO
v Bratislave
Pedagogická fakulta
Katedra pedagogiky
Račianska 59, 813 34 Bratislava

